# David Magney Environmental Consulting

P.O. Box 1346, Ojai, California 93024-1346 \* E-mail: david@magney.org 805/646-6045 Voice \* 805/646-6975 FAX

www.magney.org

22 May 2009

Christopher Williamson, Senior Planner Planning Division City of Oxnard 214 S. C Street Oxnard, CA 93030

#### Subject: Comments on the Oxnard 2030 General Plan Draft EIR (SCH# 2007041024)

Dear Mr. Williamson:

David Magney Environmental Consulting (DMEC) has been retained by the Environmental Defense Center to review and comment on the City of Oxnard's 2030 General Plan (GP2030) on behalf of the Environmental Defense Center, the Sierra Club, Los Padres Chapter, and the Environmental Coalition of Ventura County. This letter provides comments on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) for the GP2030. DMEC's comments will focus primarily on biological resource issues assessed, or not adequately assessed in the DEIR published in February 2009.

DMEC has been in business since July 1997, specializing in biological resource assessments, CEQA, and wetlands (including delineation, impact assessment, and mitigation planning). DMEC is owned by Mr. David L. Magney. Mr. Magney is a biologist and geographer, specializing in botanical resources and wetlands, and has been consulting full time since 1985, working for Dames & Moore, Jones & Stokes Associates, Fugro West, Inc., and ENSR before establishing DMEC. Mr. Magney is considered an expert on the flora of Ventura County, and has been "certified" as a qualified biologist by Ventura County Planning Division, Los Angeles County Regional Planning (SEATAC), and Santa Barbara County. He serves on the Los Angeles County Environmental Review Board. Mr. Magney's CV is attached.

DMEC received assistance in this review from Mr. Elihu Gevirtz, AICP, a professional land use planner working on Comprehensive Plan policies and analysis of impacts to biological resources in southern California for 20 years.

This letter provides comments regarding the adequacy of the impact assessment on biological resources present within the City of Oxnard and its Sphere of Influence. The policies in the Open Space and Conservation Elements of a General Plan are extremely important, are probably the most important tool, in protecting biological resources. Once land within the City's jurisdiction is zoned, projects proposed according to current zoning may not receive discretionary review, and any sensitive biological resources present could be entirely eliminated from the project site without any mitigation or repercussions, other than the loss of the resource. It is for this reason, that the City's General Plan, and the impact assessment of the plan, is of extreme importance.

The issues of concern are summarized below, followed by more detailed analysis and comments organized by specific resource issue or area. The relevant GP2030 objectives that will be addressed in this comment letter include:

- Provide options for better usage of land such as infill or mixed use development;
- Protect existing land uses from incompatible development; and



• Address recent environmental issues such as green house gases, long-term water supply and conservation, and alternative energy sources.

None of the stated objectives (on Page 2-6 of the DEIR) identify biological resources, a serious omission which must be rectified. It should be one of the City's GP objectives to protect and restore the biological resources of the Oxnard Plain and coastal habitats.

The goals and policies within the General Plan that are articulated as ER-1 through ER-4 are good because they articulate some of the City's values and encourage protection of biological resources. However, the goals should be rewritten as full sentences so that the City's intent can be understood. Currenty the goals are simply subject headers, but the policies should be unambiguously identified as policies so that the City's intention is clear. For example, ER-1.1 should be titled "Policy ER-1.1".

# SUMMARY OF ISSUES OF CONCERN

A summary of the issues of concern related to biological resources include:

- Inadequate protection policies
- Unenforceable resource protection policy language
- Lack of adequate baseline conditions
- Failure to use best available data on resources present in planning area
- Failure to identify all (or even a majority of) the sensitive resources known to occur in Oxnard
- Lack of adequate protection of Ormond Beach wetlands.

Three elements of the GP, the Land Use Element, the Open Space Element and the Conservation Element, are the primary components of the GP that contain, or should contain, goals, objectives, and policies to protect biological resources within the City's jurisdiction. Comments on the draft GP2030 will be provided under separate cover.

# SPECIFIC ISSUES OF CONCERN

Specific issues addressed in this letter focus on the DEIR and the BR, which the DEIR relies upon so greatly. The specific issues include:

- an inadequate description of baseline conditions
- lack of an adequate identification and assessment of special-status species of vascular and nonvascular plants;
- lack of adequate description of existing habitats, or delineation of sensitive habitats known to occur in Oxnard;
- inadequately defined thresholds of significance;
- inadequate space (land) provided for habitat migration as sea level rises;
- inadequate or unclear resource protection policies; and
- inadequate or infeasible mitigation measures.



## **Inadequate Baseline Conditions**

The DEIR fails to provide an adequate means to identify, much less assess, what biological resources are known to occur in the City. This is evidenced by what resources were used and which existing data resources were ignored. In order for there to be any real assessment of a plan's effects on a natural resource, the City must attempt to determine what is present, at a scale appropriate for the plan.

The DEIR based its assessment on minimal or gross data of little value for a citywide assessment. FRAP data were used, developed for use on a statewide basis, to determine which plant communities and wildlife habitats were present. In addition, the City failed to use existing data developed for the Ventura County Planning Division by DMEC in 2006.

The Background Report (BR), dated April 2006 reportedly provides all the data needed by the City to perform impact assessments and resource management decisions related to the General Plan, all contained within 20 pages (5-1 through 5-20). How can that be? This letter, describing the data deficiencies of the BR and DEIR, is over 20 pages long. This is so because the preparers of the Background Report failed to conduct any fieldwork or use many recent sources of data readily available for the asking.

The methods described in the BR included the typical generic list of considerations; however, it failed to every identify any locally important species or habitats known to occur in Oxnard, information that is readily available, including the California Native Plant Society's Channel Islands Chapter checklist of rare vascular plants of Ventura County, published since 2001 on the chapter's website (www.cnpsci.org). This list was the basis of Ventura County Planning Division's List of Locally Important Species in 2006, until it simply adopted the CNPS list in late 2008<sup>1</sup>.

The DEIR relies on the Background Report (BR, dated April 2006) as the basis for what biological resources are present within the City. The BR allocates only 20 pages to providing the baseline conditions for all plant communities, habitats, and plant and wildlife species. Such a skimpy level of assessment MAY be adequate for a vacant lot in the middle of a developed area, but barely. The glossed-over nature and simplicity of the BR's description of biological resources present within the City is a gross simplification of the truth. Actually, such a cursory description belies the truth that the City of Oxnard has a very rich and diverse flora and fauna.

Page 5-1 of the BR, Methods, lists several (7) resources it used to identify sensitive biological resources. Most of those resources were just lists of species, lacking any locality data. Nothing else is included in the methods section, such as how the preparers determined which species, common or rare, actually occurred in Oxnard, or where in Oxnard they occurred.

No attempt was made to map the natural vegetation and land cover; rather, a cut-out from the state's FRAP mapping was used to determine habitats present in Oxnard. However, the FRAP data are very coarse, usually inaccurate, and lack ground-truthing. DMEC knows this because it created a plant communities GIS database for the Ventura County Planning Division, cobbling together existing GIS databases, including FRAP data (DMEC 2006<sup>2</sup>). The Ventura County vegetation cover GIS database was created from previous work, including: Ventura River Vegetation (David Magney Environmental Consulting & GeoInsight International 2003), Santa Clara River Vegetation (CH<sub>2</sub>MHill through Ventura County Flood Control District circa 1998), Calleguas Creek Watershed Vegetation (AMEC 2000), Oak Woodlands

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Christina Danko, Biologist, Ventura County Planning Division, Ventura, CA. Telephone communication dated December 2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> David Magney Environmental Consulting. 2006. Vegetation Cover GIS Database of Ventura County, California. 20 June 2006. (PN 03-0001.) Ojai, California. Prepared for Ventura County Planning Division, Ventura, California.



Study (DMEC 2000), *Adenostoma sparsifolium* Study (DMEC 2004), Los Padres National Forest Vegetation (date unknown), and Gap Analysis of Mainland California (UCSB, USGS, and CDFG 1998 – Davis et al. 1995<sup>1</sup>), with the last of these being the most general. The BR, in Table 5-1, Page 5-7, lists acreage values for only nine (9) habitat types, two of which are developed types and one representing planted Eucalyptus groves and windrows.

More detailed mapping has been done for parts of Oxnard for a variety of projects, which should have been obtained and used in the BR. Detailed habitat maps are available for Ormond Beach and Mandalay Beach, with the most recent mapping having been conducted by DMEC in late 2008/early 2009 of Southern California Edison's Mandalay Beach property. Just on the SCE property, DMEC mapped 293 polygons consisting of 35 alliances in 18 broader groups (based on the primary dominant plant), plus four other land cover types (water, roads, ruderal, and developed), on 53+ acres of land east of Harbor Boulevard and north and south of the Edison Canal.

Every development project EIR within the City contains a map of plant communities/habitats, which should have been used, at the least, to create a better habitat map for the city, as not all projects get developed (if they had, then the habitats present would largely have been destroyed). While uniformity in mapping is desired, unless the city is willing to have the city's natural resources actually documented well, they could at least have used existing information and developed a more refined map then was done for the GP2030. Also, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service National Wetlands Inventory maps are available in GIS format, which were completed for most of Ventura County in 2006.

Page 5-2 of the BR defines some key terms, i.e. "Sensitive Natural Community, Special-Status Species, and Wetlands and Other Waters of the U.S.". For Sensitive Natural Community, the BR defines it as "a biological community that is regionally rare, provides important habitat opportunities for wildlife, are structurally complex, or are in other ways of special concern to local, State, or Federal agencies". While the definition is good, there is no evidence that the preparers made any attempt to identify any communities that are regionally rare, or those that provide important habitat. The habitat mapping that was used (FRAP) is very coarse and general, and does not identify those habitats that are sensitive. The BR baseline conditions need to be improved to correct this deficiency.

DMEC developed a list of sensitive plant communities for the Ventura County Planning Division based on our knowledge of the vegetation of Ventura County, and using CDFG's list of sensitive plant communities. The result was that 153 plant communities considered rare (i.e. sensitive) are known to occur in the County, 65 of which occur in Oxnard. Based on that list, those sensitive communities known or expected to occur in Oxnard are provided below in Table 1, Sensitive Plant Communities of the Oxnard Area.

Code	Plant Community Name	Scientific Names	Holland Code
21.100.00	Sand-verbena-Beach Bursage	Abronia villosa-Ambrosia chamissonis	21210
21.100.07	Strand		
21.100.10	Southern Dune Scrub		21330
21.110.00	Beach Bursage	Ambrosia chamissonis	
31.200.00	Southern Coastal Bluff Scrub		31200

 Table 1. Sensitive Plant Communities of the Oxnard Area

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Davis, F.W., P.A. Stine, D.M. Stoms, M.I. Borchert, and A.D. Hollander. 1995. Gap Analysis of the Actual Vegetation of California: 1. The Southwestern Region. *Madroño* 42(1):40-78.



Codo	Plant Community Nama	Scientific Nomes	Holland
22.020.05	Plant Community Ivanc	Science realities operational intervalia and hybrids	Coue
22.020.03	Black Sage - Coast Flickly-pear	Saliva menujera-Opunita unorans ana nyorias	┼───┦
22.040.03	California Duckwheat - Dig Sageorush		╂────┦
32.040.04	California Buckwheat Aliuviai Fali	Erlogonum fasciculaium	╂────┦
32.030.00	California Encelia		
32.030.02	California Encelia	Encella caujornica	┨────┦
32.000.05	Covote Brush / Creeping Kyegrass	Baccharis phularis/Leymus truicolaes	
22.000.10	Cover Drielly Deer Succelent Semb	Baccharis puttaris / Nassetta putchra	┨────┦
32.150.00	Coast Prickly Pear Succulent Scrub		21220
22.100.00	Ulasta Coldonkuch	Lupinus chamissonis-isocoma menziesu	21550
32.100.01	Heather Goldenbush		┼───┦
32.100.02	Dune Lupine	Lupinus chamissonis	┼───┦
32.100.05	Dune Lupine - Heamer Goldenbush		
41 140 00	Sugarbush Scrub		┼───┦
41.140.00	Nodding Needlegrass	Nassella cernua	┼───┦
41.150.00	Purple Needlegrass	Nassella pulchra	
41.150.01	Italian Ryegrass - Purple Needlegrass	Lolium multifiorum-Nasseua puicnra	
41.150.02	Wild Oats - Purple Needlegrass	Avena fatua-ivasseita puicnra	42110
41.170.00	Valley Needlegrass Grassland	Achnatherum spp.	42110
41.200.06	Jaumea – Saltgrass	Jaumea carnosa-Distichlis spicata	
41.200.07	Saltgrass - Alkalı Heath – Jaumea	Distichlis spicata-Frankenia salina-Jaumea carnosa	
41.200.08	Alkali Saltgrass	+	12200
41.290.00	Wildflower Field		42300
41.640.00	Blue Wildrye Grassland	Elymus glaucus	
41.640.01	Blue Wildrye	Elymus glaucus	
45.210.07	Spikerush - Water Pygmy	Eleocharis sppCrassula aquatica	
52.101.00	Bulrush	Scirpus spp.	
52.101.01	California Bulrush Wetland	Scirpus californicus	
52.102.04	Brackish Bulrush – Cattail	<i>Scirpus</i> spp <i>Typha</i> spp.	52200
52.103.01	Brackish Cattail	<i>Typha</i> spp.	
52.107.00	Pondweeds with floating leaves Wetland	Potamogeton spp.	
52.108.00	Pondweeds with submerged leaves Wetland	Potamogeton spp.	
52.111.02	Common Three-square/ Silverleaf Cinqufoil	Scirpus americanus/Potentilla anserina	
52.112.00	Alkali Bulrush	Scirpus maritimus	
52.112.01	Alkali Bulrush / Pickleweed	Scirpus maritimus/Salicornia spp.	
52.112.02	Alkali Bulrush – Cattail	Scirpus maritima Typha spp.	
52.201.00	Pickleweed Wetland	Salicornia spp.	-
52.201.01	Common Pickleweed	Salicornia virginica	-
52.201.03	Common Pickleweed – Saltgrass	Salicornia virginica-Distichlis spicata	-
52.201.04	Common Pickleweed - Jaumea – Saltgrass	Salicornia virginica-Jaumea carnosa	
52.201.07	South Coastal Pickleweed Salt Marsh		
52.201.08	Alkali Pickleweed		
52.202.00	Ditch-grass Wetland	<i>Ruppia</i> spp.	
1	Black Cottonwood Riparian Forests and		
61.120.00	Woodlands	Populus balsamifera	61110



			Holland
Code	Plant Community Name	Scientific Names	Code
61.130.02	Southern Cottonwood - Willow Riparian	Populus sppSalix spp.	61330
61.201.00	Arroyo Willow Riparian Forests and Woodlands	Salix lasiolepis	
61.201.01	Central Coast Arroyo Willow Riparian	Salix lasiolepis	61230
61.201.02	Southern Arroyo Willow Riparian	Salix lasiolepis	
61.204.00	Pacific Willow Riparian Forests	Salix lucida ssp. lasiandra	
61.205.00	Red Willow Riparian Forests	Salix laevigata	
61.207.00	Mixed Willow Riparian Forests and Woodlands	Salix spp.	
61.208.00	Southern Willow Scrub	<i>Salix</i> spp.	
61.800.00	Walnut	Juglans spp.	
61.920.00	Southern Mixed Riparian Forest		61340
61.930.00	Southern Riparian Forest		61300
63.110.00	Narrowleaf Willow	Salix exigua	63410
63.130.00	Southern Willow	<i>Salix</i> spp.	63320
63.160.00	Subalpine Wetland Shrub Habitat		
63.410.01	Elderberry Savanna	Sambucus mexicana	63440
63.900.00	Southern Riparian Scrub		63300
72.100.01	California Walnut Woodland	Juglans californica var. californica	71210

Many of these sensitive habitats are wetland habitats, and many of them are coastal in nature. These communities are at extreme risk of extirpation from development, indirect impacts from human actions and land use practices, and encroachment by the ocean as sea levels rise.

# SEA LEVEL RISE

While the issue of sea level rise is addressed by others, the effects of the eventual rise in sea level on Oxnard's biological resources needs to be seriously considered in the GP2030 and DEIR. The scientific consensus is that sea level is rising. While the GP2030 is projected out only 20 years, the land use decisions made now will lock in development and habitat restoration scenarios that are expected to last much longer than 20 years.

Oxnard ranges in elevation from sea level to about 50 feet near downtown, with higher elevations (about 150 feet) at the extreme northeast corner of the city's sphere of influence near the Camarillo Hills, as depicted on Figure 1-2, Jurisdictional Boundaries Map GP2030. This means that a significant portion of the more coastal portions of the city will be impacted/inundated as the sea level rises.

While the level of sea level rise that will occur in the next 100 years is unknown, it is known to be rising, and will rise enough to result in recession of the coast inland. This means that low-lying coastal areas will be inundated. All of the coastal habitats in Oxnard contain sensitive habitats and species, especially in the Ormond Beach area. Ormond Beach and the Mugu Lagoon are at extreme risk as these are low-lying areas. The only remedy to mitigate sea level rise and its impact on coastal habitats is for the City to provide land adjacent to the existing habitats onto which they can migrate. The movement of plants and animals for long-term survival is the natural ecological process that occurs when humans are not altering the landscape; however, the GP2030, if adopted as drafted, will preclude any such natural migration.



As this scenario is predictable and has been forecast by the scientific community, it is necessary for the City to assess impacts to the habitats and species that will be affected by the lack of a migration path when sea level rises. The Coastal Conservancy and The Nature Conservancy, and others, have long been developing habitat restoration plans for Ormond Beach, including work by Mr. Magney while with Jones & Stokes Associates (1995<sup>1</sup>). The proposed land uses in the Ormond Beach area will prevent natural, or even managed, migration of habitats upslope as sea level rises. This issue needs to be properly considered in the GP2030 and assessed in the DEIR.

# Special-status Vascular Plants

The DEIR fails to provide an adequate means to identify, much less assess, what botanical resources are known to occur in the City. Its dependence on the BR is a large part of the problem, since the BR lacks any meaningful accounting or identification of the biological resources that is present in the City.

Based on Mr. Magney's extensive research of the flora of Ventura County over the past 30 years, 456 vascular plant taxa (including species, subspecies, and varieties) are known or have been reported as occurring in Oxnard.

BR Page 5-3 lists Skinner and Pavlik (1994) as its source for describing CNPS-listed vascular plant species. CNPS has greatly modified the 5<sup>th</sup> edition of the Inventory since then, with the publication of the 6<sup>th</sup> edition in 2001 and the constantly updated online version at <u>www.cnps.org</u>. CNPS clearly states that all plants on all of CNPS's lists should be considered as special-status species and evaluated as such during project assessments pursuant to CEQA. CNPS states, "Very few of the plants constituting List 4 meet the definitions of Sec. 1901, Chapter 10 (Native Plant Protection Act) or Secs. 2062 and 2067 (California Endangered Species Act) of the California Department of Fish and Game Code, and few, if any, are eligible for state listing. Nevertheless, many of them are significant locally, and we strongly recommend that List 4 plants be evaluated for consideration during preparation of environmental documents relating to CEQA"<sup>2</sup>.

DMEC has determined, through Mr. Magney's personal research of the flora of Ventura County, that approximately 465 vascular plant taxa are known to occur (or have occurred) in the Oxnard area of the Oxnard Plain, including the areas along the immediate coast, and not including plants occurring exclusively on the Santa Clara River. Of these, 123 taxa (26%) are considered rare or uncommon (10 or fewer populations) in Ventura County (Magney 2008<sup>3</sup>) or rare from a statewide perspective. A list of all the vascular plants known to occur in Oxnard is included in Table 2, Vascular Plants of Oxnard, California, found at the end of this letter.

As an example of how Oxnard is very important botanically, besides containing habitat for many rare species, a variety of dock, named here as Oxnard Dock (*Rumex fueginus* var. *ovato-cordatus*) was first collected from Oxnard by Joseph Burtt Davy in 1901 (7804 UC Holotype!<sup>4</sup>). Oxnard, as it was in 1901, is the Type Locality for this variety of dock. Unfortunately, this plant has not been collected from Ventura

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Jones & Stokes Associates, Inc. 1995. South Ormond Beach Wetland Restoration and Management Plan. (JSA 94-080.) Sacramento, California. Prepared for City of Oxnard Community Development Department, Oxnard, California.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> California Native Plant Society, webpage "The CNPS Ranking System", <u>http://www.cnps.org/cnps/rareplants/ranking.php</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Magney, D.L. 2008. Checklist of Ventura County Rare Plants. 23 December 2008, Fourteenth edition. California Native Plant Society, Channel Islands Chapter, Ojai, California. Published on <u>http://www.cnpsci.org/PlantInfo/01RarePlants.htm</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> 7804 is J. Burtt Davy's collection number. "UC" stands for the University of California Jepson Herbarium. "Holotype" means it is the voucher specimen from which the taxon was formally described from.



County since, and has likely been extirpated from the county and city as a direct result of land use decisions that eliminated its habitat.

Also speaking to the importance of the natural habitats found in and immediately adjacent to Oxnard are eleven (11) plant taxa that are rare globally or from a statewide perspective:

- *Abronia maritima* (Sticky Sand-verbena, Nyctaginaceae), a CNPS List 4 species (Plants of Limited Distribution). This species occurs on the dune habitats of Ormond Beach, Oxnard Shores, and Mandalay Beach;
- *Astragalus pycnostachyus* var. *lanosissimus* (Ventura Marsh Milkvetch, Fabaceae), Listed Endangered. This extremely rare plant is only known naturally at one site, the unfinished North Shore at Mandalay site on Mandalay Beach, with failed experimental plantings at McGrath Lake and Ormond Beach;
- *Calystegia sepium* ssp. *binghamiae* (Bingham Morning-glory, Convolvulaceae), CNPS List 1A (presumed extinct). This small vine grows at the edges/transitional areas of coastal saltmarshes in Oxnard, but is presumed extinct due to the loss of habitat;
- *Cordylanthus maritimus* ssp. *maritimus* (Saltmarsh Bird's Beak, Orobanchaceae), Listed Endangered. This endangered annual wetland plant grows in coastal lagoon habitats when salinity is not too high;
- *Delphinium parryi* ssp. *blochmaniae* (Blochman Larkspur, Ranunculaceae), CNPS List 1B (Plants Rare and Endangered in California and Elsewhere). This larkspur grows on coastal dune scrub habitats, most of which has been eliminated in Oxnard by development;
- *Juncus acutus* ssp. *leopoldii* (Southwestern Spiny Rush, Juncaceae), CNPS List 4. This perennial clumping graminoid grows at the edges of brackish marshes such as in dune swale habitats, most of which has been filled in by development;
- *Phacelia ramosissima* var. *austrolittoralis* (South Coast Branching Phacelia, Boraginaceae), CNPS List 4. This perennial wildflower grows on dune scrub habitats, most of which has been eliminated by development;
- *Pseudognaphalium leucocephalum* (Whiteleaf Everlasting, Asteraceae), CNPS List 2. Same as above;
- *Suaeda californica* var. *pubescens* (Hairy California Seablite, Chenopodiaceae), CNPS List 1B. This shrub grows in coastal saltmarsh habitats, most of which has been filled in for development;
- Suaeda esteroa (Estuary Seablite, Chenopodiaceae), CNPS List 1B. Same as above;
- Suaeda taxifolia (California Seablite, Chenopodiaceae), CNPS List 4. Same as above.

The DEIR should specifically assess impacts to them, and all the species on Table 2, resulting from the adoption and implementation of the GP2030. Without such an assessment and feasible mitigation, most of these species will be extirpated from Oxnard.

# Special-status Non-vascular Plants

While the BR states that it consulted the CDFG "Special Vascular Plants, Bryophytes, and Lichens List" as part of its methods in determining which plant species should be considered as sensitive, nowhere in the BR does it ever list any species of bryophyte or lichen. There are numerous species of each group known to occur in Oxnard, but no consideration, evaluation, or literature search was conducted to even come up

Oxnard Planning Div. - Comments on the Oxnard 2030 General Plan DEIR (SCH# 2007041024) 5/22/2009 Page 9



with a list of species that might occur in Oxnard. A simple reading of some of the documents in the City's possession, or on the Internet, can provide much more information than has been included in the BR. They could have also contacted a few experts and acquired much relevant data. Making such an effort is of vital importance since the EIR depends on the information provided in the BR on biological resources to make it determinations on significant impacts.

Just as an example of information about nonvascular plants known to occur in the City, DMEC collected, identified, and reported on the plants, vascular and nonvascular, found on SCE's Mandalay Beach property. DMEC found several species of mosses on a stabilized sand dune. The mosses found include at least one species each of *Didymodon* (shown on photograph below on left), *Syntrichia* (shown on photograph below on right), and *Timmia*. In fact, the *Syntrichia* found is likely a new species to science<sup>1</sup>, not yet described. It is possible that it may be rare.



Photographs of mosses in Oxnard. Didymodon on left, undescribed species of Syntrichia on right.

The image below is of several lichens collected from Mandalay Beach. As seen on the photograph, nine (9) different species of crustose lichens are indicated by red numbers; however, there are actually at least two more species of lichens present. This is from just one small site in northwestern Oxnard, and many have been seen on other parts of Oxnard, such as at Ormond Beach. Many more species of lichens are present in Oxnard, some of which may be rare.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Correspondence with bryologists Carl Wishner and Tomas Hallingbäck.





Lichens that are considered to be rare in Ventura County, at least on a preliminary basis (Magney 1999<sup>1</sup>), include:

- Acarospora theloccoides
- Caloplaca invadens
- Caloplaca chrysopthalma
- Caloplaca epithallina
- Caloplaca luteominia
- Caloplaca supyracella
- Endocarpon subnitescens
- Parmotrema austrosinense
- Pertusaria flavicunda
- Phaeophyscia kairamoi
- Phaeophyscia sciastra
- Protoparmelia badia
- Punctelia punctilla
- Teloschistes sancti-jacobi
- Vermilacinia curuchoides
- Xanthoparmelia angustiphylla.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Magney, D.L. 1999. Preliminary List of Rare California Lichens. *California Lichen Society Bulletin* 6(2):22-27.



One or more of these rare lichens may occur in Oxnard and should be at least added to the list of species of concern in Oxnard.

Basically, nonvascular plants are important components of the biological resources of Oxnard and should be given much more attention in the BR, DEIR, and GP2030. At a minimum, the GP should have a clear policy that nonvascular plants are valuable components of the city's flora and that habitat for at least the sensitive species should be protected from development.

# Special-status Wildlife

A number of special-status wildlife species occur in or near the city. The EIR should include an analysis of potential impacts to these species that could result from buildout of the GP, and programmatic mitigation measures that can be implemented to reduce the significance of the impacts. The GP update process provides an opportunity that should not be missed to plan and provide for the restoration of habitat linkages that would benefit special-status and other wildlife species.

A number of special-status wildlife species are not even considered, such as the native terrestrial land snails. Several native terrestrial snails are rare in Ventura County and known to occur in Oxnard, such as *Helminthoglypta traskii* (Magney 2005<sup>1</sup>). Some of these rare snails are tracked by the CNDDB, even though they have not developed GIS locations for them yet. These snails, and other wildlife species, need to be considered in the DEIR to be adequate.

## **Standards of Significance**

The DEIR on Page 5.4 states, "The project (or the project alternatives) would result in a significant impact if it would:

- Have a substantial adverse effect, either directly or through habitat modifications, on any species identified as a candidate, sensitive, or special-status species in local or regional plans, policies, or regulations, or by the California Department of Fish and Game or U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service;
- Have a substantial adverse effect on any riparian habitat or other sensitive natural community identified in local or regional plans, policies, or regulations by the California Department of Fish and Game or U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service;
- Have a substantial adverse effect on federally protected wetlands as defined by Section 404 of the Clean Water Act (including, but not limited to, marshes, vernal pools, coastal wetlands, etc.) through direct removal, filling, hydrological interruption, or other means;
- Interfere substantially with the movement of any native resident or migratory fish or wildlife species or with established native resident or migratory wildlife corridors, or impede the use of native wildlife nursery sites; or
- Conflict with any local policies or ordinances protecting biological resources, such as a tree preservation policy or ordinance."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Magney, David L. 2005. Atlas of California Native Terrestrial Snails in Ventura County. 16 March 2005. David Magney Environmental Consulting, Ojai, California. Prepared for County of Ventura, Resource Management Agency, Planning Division. Ventura, California. Available at: <u>http://magney.org/photofiles/VenturaCountySnails1.htm</u>



These statements are nice, but lack any of the specifics or metrics that are really necessary to be meaningful and measurable. As they stand, these statements are quite subjective and do not provide the decisionmakers, experts, and public with an adequate tool by which to determine significance. Significance thresholds should provide meaningful metrics, but the DEIR fails to provide them.

Without measurable standards, it is no wonder that the DEIR preparers did not find ANY significant impacts from adoption and implementation of the GP2030. This problem can be remedied quite easily, and the standards should be changed accordingly.

For example, a significance threshold to measure whether a plant community would be significantly impacted could read: *Any project that results in a 10 percent reduction of a plant community shall be considered a significant impact*. Such a threshold is clear, measurable, simple, and justifiable. The only subjective part of such a threshold is the 10 percent part. However, a 10 percent change is a reasonable threshold, which is neither excessive nor too restrictive.

Some resources are so valuable and so important that no loss can be tolerated and not considered to be a significant impact. For example, a species of plant or animal listed as Endangered by the federal or state government is so rare that the loss of even one individual must be considered significant.

All parties involved in land use decisions are benefited by clear and unambiguous significance thresholds. What those thresholds should be should be based solely on science, not politics or economics. The political and economic considerations are appropriate only after the significant impacts have been clearly identified.

# **Impact Analysis**

DMEC finds the impact analysis inadequate in accurately or completely assessing impacts to biological resources, ignoring many impacts entirely. The impacts that were identified are inadequate and should be revised and re-examined, with some suggestions provided below.

**Impact 5.2-1** The Project could have a substantial adverse effect, either directly or through habitat modifications, on a variety of special status species as a result of habitat conversion, indirect impacts, habitat fragmentation, and encroachment by exotic weeds.

This impact is potentially significant. The impact analysis should include a quantification of the acreages of habitats that would be converted and/or fragmented. It should also include a quantification of impacts to specific populations for special status species. These numbers should be compared to the acreages of these habitats and population numbers remaining in or on the edges of the city that could be impacted by build-out of the General Plan. No new studies are suggested. Reasonable estimates based on information presently available would be sufficient. The purpose of this suggestion is to provide an accurate measurement of the impacts, and to ensure that they are adequately mitigated and easily monitored.

To mitigate the impact of encroachment by exotic weeds, the following text should be added to the General Plan or Zoning Ordinance.

**Suggested New Policy #1** All Final Development Plans shall be required to include a landscape plan to be submitted to the City for approval. No landscape plans shall include plants that are listed by the California Invasive Plant Council as being a High Threat. The list is available at: http://www.cal-ipc.org/ip/inventory



**Impact 5.2-3** The Project could have a substantial adverse effect on sensitive natural communities including riparian habitats.

This impact is potentially significant. In order to adequately mitigate the impact, the following General Plan policies should be modified as provided below.

**ER-1.1.** Protective measures shall include but not be limited to: buffers of native vegetation between development and habitat areas.

**ER-2.2.** These designations should occur as part of this General Plan update process and when additional resources are identified during subsequent discretionary review of development proposals. The policy should also be modified to specify the types of habitats that are considered sensitive. These should include, for example, wetlands, riparian habitat, the Mugu Lagoon, sand dunes, trees and other habitats used by birds for nesting and roosting, locations of special-status and locally important plants and animals.

**ER-3.1**. All development requiring discretionary approval shall be required to provide buffers of riparian habitat. These buffers shall be vegetated with appropriate native species.

**ER-4.1.** The second "protection" in the sentence should be deleted. Contiguous areas of sensitive habitat should be identified and designated as protected land in the City's 2030 General Plan prior to its adoption so that permanent protection of these habitat areas is assured.

**ER-4.6**. These protective zoning designations should be adopted as part of the current 2030 General Plan process.

**Impact 5.2-4.** The Project could have a substantial adverse effect on federally protected wetlands and other waters.

This impact is potentially significant. In order to adequately mitigate the impact, the following General Plan policies should be modified as provided below.

**ER-2.1**. Any public or private project in the vicinity of the Ormond Beach wetlands or Mugu Lagoon shall be required to provide buffers adjacent to the wetlands and their tributaries, avoid sedimentation and the introduction of pollutants, and minimize noise, light, and glare that would adversely impact wildlife associated with these wetlands.

**Suggested New Policy #2** All new development shall be required to capture runoff water onsite in order to minimize sedimentation in riparian and wetland areas downstream. Biofilters using native plants are encouraged wherever feasible.

**Impact 5.2-5:** The Project could have a substantial adverse effect on wildlife habitat, nursery sites, or movement opportunities.

This is a potentially significant impact. In order to adequately mitigate this impact, the following new policy should be incorporated into the General Plan.

**Suggested New Policy #3** Any agricultural lands that are proposed for development and any agricultural lands that are proposed for annexation to facilitate future development shall be required to provide at least three percent of the land for habitat restoration to provide habitat for plants and food and shelter for animals, and to protect any remaining native habitat on those lands so that habitat continuity in the city and connections to the Santa Clara River and Mugu Lagoon wetlands for example is continued and expanded.

Oxnard Planning Div. - Comments on the Oxnard 2030 General Plan DEIR (SCH# 2007041024) 5/22/2009 Page 14



DMEC wishes to recognize that while this letter is highly critical of certain aspects of the 2030GP DEIR, many aspects of the DEIR are good, and should be supported by eliminating the deficiencies identified above.

Respectfully,

David L. Magney President

cc: Karen Kraus, Environmental Defense Center

Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Abronia maritima - CNPS 4	Sticky Sand-verbena, Beach Pancake	PH	Nyctaginaceae
Abronia umbellata var. umbellata	Beach Sand-verbena	PH	Nyctaginaceae
Abronia villosa var. aurita - VR	Desert Sand-verbana	PH	Nyctaginaceae
Acacia longiflorus*	Golden Wattle	S	Fabaceae
Achillea millefolium	White Yarrow	AH	Asteraceae
Achnatherum brachychaetum	Shortbristled Needlegrass	PG	Poaceae
Acroptilon repens *	Russian Knapweed	PH	Asteraceae
Agapanthus africanus *	Lily-of-the-Nile	PH	Liliaceae
Agoseris heterophylla var. cryptopleura - VU	Mountain Dandelion	AH	Asteraceae
Agrostis stolonifera var. palustris - VU	Creeping Bentgrass	PG	Poaceae
Agrostis viridis*	Green Bentgrass	PG	Poaceae
Albizia lophantha*	Plume Acacia	Т	Fabaceae
Allenrolfea occidentalis	Iodinebush	S	Chenopodiaceae
Alternanthera caracasana*	Alternanthera	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Amaranthus albus *	Prostrate Pigweed	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amaranthus blithoides	Prostrate Amaranth	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amaranthus deflexus*	Low Amaranth	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amaranthus hybridus*	Hybrid Amaranth	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amaranthus powellii ssp. bocuhonii - VR	Powell Amaranth	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amaranthus retroflexus*	Red-root Amaranth	AH	Amaranthaceae
Amblyopappus pusillus	Dwarf Coastweed	PH	Asteraceae
Ambrosia acanthicarpa	Burweed	AH	Asteraceae
Ambrosia artemisiifolia	Common Ragweed	AH	Asteraceae
Ambrosia chamissonis - VU	Beach Bur	S	Asteraceae
Ambrosia psilostachya var. californica	Western Ragweed	BH	Asteraceae
Ammophila arenaria *	European Beachgrass	PG	Poaceae
Amsinckia menziesii var. intermedia	Rancher's Fire, Common Fiddleneck	AH	Boraginaceae
Amsinckia spectabilis var. spectabilis - VR	Seaside Fiddleneck	AH	Boraginaceae

#### Table 2. Vascular Plants of Oxnard, California



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Anagallis arvensis *	Scarlet Pimpernel	AH	Primulaceae
Anemopsis californica var. californica	Yerba Manza	PH	Saururaceae
Anthemis cotula *	Mayweed	AH	Asteraceae
Antirrhinum majus*	Snapdragon	S	Veronicaceae
Antirrhinum nuttallianum ssp. subsessile - VR	Lesser Nuttall Snapdragon	AV	Veronicaceae
Apium graveolens *	Celery	PH	Apiaceae
Arachis hypogaea *	Peanut	PH	Fabaceae
Araujia sericifera *	Bladderflower	PV	Apocynaceae
Argentina egedii ssp. egedii	Cinquefoil	PH	Rosaceae
Artemisia biennis *	Biennial Wormwood	BH	Asteraceae
Artemisia californica	California Sagebrush	S	Asteraceae
Artemisia douglasiana	Mugwort	PH	Asteraceae
Artemisia dracunculus	Wormwood	PH	Asteraceae
Artemisia tridentata ssp. tridentata	Big Sagebrush	S	Asteraceae
Arthrocnemum [Salicornia] subterminale - VR	Common Glasswort	S	Chenopodiaceae
Arundo donax *	Giant Reed	PG	Poaceae
Asclepias fasicularis	Narrowleaf Milkweed	PH	Asclepidaceae
Asparagus asparagoides*	Smilax Asparagus	PV	Liliaceae
Asparagus officinalis ssp. officinalis *	Common Asparagus	PH	Liliaceae
Aster subulatus var. ligulatus	Annual Saltmarsh Aster	AH	Asteraceae
Astragalus douglasii var. douglasii	Douglas Milkvetch	PH	Fabaceae
Astragalus leucopsis var. leucopsis - VR	Coast Rattleweed	PH	Fabaceae
Astragalus pycnostachyus var. lanosissimus - LE	Ventura Marsh Milkvetch	PH	Fabaceae
Astragalus trichopodus var. lonchus - VU	Three-pod Milkvetch	PH	Fabaceae
Astragalus trichopodus var. phoxus	Antisell Three-pod Milkvetch	PH	Fabaceae
Atriplex argentea var. mohavensis - VR	Mojave Silverscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex californica - VU	California Saltbush	PH/S	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex lentiformis ssp. lentiformis - VU	Big Saltbrush	S	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex lentiformis var. breweri	Brewer Saltbush	S	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex leucophylla - VU	Beach Saltbush or Seascale	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex patula ssp. hastata	Arrowleaf Saltbush	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex prostrata - VR	Triangle Orache	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex rosea*	Rose or Red or Tumbling Orache	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex semibaccata *	Australian Saltbush	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex serenana var. davidsonii - VR	Davidson Bractscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex serenana var. serenna - VR	Bractscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex subspicata*	Saline Saltscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex triangularis - VU	Spearscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex vesicaria*	Aboriginal Saltbush	S	Chenopodiaceae
Atriplex watsonii - VR	Matscale	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Avena barbata *	Slender Oat	AG	Poaceae
Avena fatua *	Wild Oat	AG	Poaceae
Azolla filiculoides - VU	Mosquito Fern	AF	Azollaceae
Baccharis douglasii - VU	Saltmarsh Baccharis	S	Asteraceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Baccharis pilularis ssp. consanguinea	Coyote Brush	S	Asteraceae
Baccharis salicifolia	Mulefat	S	Asteraceae
Bassia hyssopifolia *	Five-hook	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Batis maritima - VR	Saltwort	S	Bataceae
Berula erecta - VU	Cutleaf Waterparsnip	PH	Apiaceae
Beta vulgaris *	Common Beet	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Bidens laevis - VR	Smooth Beggartick	AH	Asteraceae
Bidens pilosa var. pilosa*	Common Beggar-ticks	AH	Asteraceae
Bolboschoenus maritimus var. paludosus - VR	Saltmarsh Bulrush	PH	Cyperaceae
Bolboschoenus robustus - VR	Seashore Bulrush	PH	Cyperaceae
Bothriochloa barbinodis - VU	Cane Bluestem	PG	Poaceae
Brassica nigra *	Black Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Brassica rapa *	Rape Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Brassica tournefortii *	Saharan Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Brickellia desertorum - VR	Desert Brickllebush	PH	Asteraceae
Bromus carinatus	California Brome	PG	Poaceae
Bromus catharticus*	Rescue Grass	AG/BG	Poaceae
Bromus diandrus *	Ripgut Grass	AG	Poaceae
Bromus hordeaceus *	Soft Chess	AG	Poaceae
Bromus madritensis ssp. madritensis *	Madrid Brome	AG	Poaceae
Bromus madritensis ssp. rubens *	Red Brome	AG	Poaceae
Bromus tectorum var. tectorum *	Cheat Grass	AG	Poaceae
Cakile edentula	American Searocket	AH	Poaceae
Cakile maritima *	European Searocket	AH	Brassicaceae
Callistemon viminalis *+	Weeping Bottlebrush	S	Myrtaceae
Callitropsis macrocarpa +	Monterey Cypress	Т	Cupressaceae
Calystegia macrostegia var. ?	Island False Bindweed	PV	Convolvulaceae
Calystegia sepium ssp. binghamiae - CNPS 1A	Bingham Morning-glory	PV	Convolvulaceae
Calystegia soldonella - VU	Beach Morning-glory	PV	Convolvulaceae
Camissonia bistorta	California Sun-cups	AH	Onagraceae
Camissonia cheiranthifolia ssp. suffruticosa - VU	Beach Primrose	S	Onagraceae
Capsella bursa-pastoris*	Shepherd's Purse	AH	Brassicaceae
Carex pansa - VR	Sand Dune Sedge	PG	Cyperaceae
Carex praegracilis	Dune Sedge	PH	Cyperaceae
Carpobrotus aequilateris *	Sea Fig	PH/S	Aizoaceae
Carpobrotus chilensis *	Sea Fig	S	Aizoaceae
Carpobrotus edulis*	Hottentot Fig	S	Aizoaceae
Castilleja affinis ssp. affinis	Lay-and-Collie's Indian Paintbrush	PH	Orobanchaceae
Castilleja exserta ssp. exserta	Purple Owl's Clover	AH	Orobanchaceae
Centaurea maculosa *	Spotted Knapweed	BH	Asteraceae
Centaurea melitensis *	Tocalote	AH	Asteraceae
Centaurea repens*	Russian Knapweed	AH	Asteraceae
Cerastium fontanum ssp. vulgare*	Common Chickweed	AH	Caryophyllaceae
Chaenactis artemisiifolia - VU	White Pincushion	AH	Asteraceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Chaenactis glabriuscula var. lanosa - VU	Wooly Yellow Pincushion	AH	Asteraceae
Chamaescyce serpyllifolia ssp. serpyllifolia - VR	Tyme-leaved Spurge	AH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamaesyce melanadenia - VR	Squaw Spurge	AH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamaesyce ocellata ssp. ocellata - VR	Littleye Spurge	AH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamaesyce polycarpa var. hirtella - VR	Hairy Golondrina	PH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamaesyce polycarpa var. polycarpa - VR	Golondrina	PH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamaesyce prostrata*	Prostrate Spurge	AH	Euphorbiaceae
Chamomilla suaveolens	Pineapple Weed	AH	Asteraceae
Chenopodium album*	Lambsquarters	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium ambrosioides var. ambrosioides*	Mexican Tea	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium ambrosioides var. suffruticosum*	Perennial Mexican Tea	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium berlandieri	Pitseed Goosefoot	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium macrospermum var. farinosum	Coast Goosefoot	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium macrospermum var. halophilum*	Coast Goosefoot	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Chenopodium murale *	Nettle-leaved Goosefoot	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Chorizanthe staticoides var. staticoides	Turkish Rugging	AH	Polygonaceae
Chrysanthemum coronarium *	Garland Chrysanthemum	AH	Asteraceae
Ciclosperum leptophyllum *	Celery	AH	Apiaceae
Cirsium occidentale var. occidentale	Cobweb Thistle	BH	Asteraceae
Cirsium vulgare *	Bull Thistle	AH	Asteraceae
Clematis ligusticifolia	Virgin's Bower	PV	Ranunculaceae
Conium maculatum *	Poison Hemlock	BH	Apiaceae
Conringia orientalis *	Hare's Ear	AH	Brassicaceae
Convolvulus arvensis *	Bindweed	PV	Convolvulaceae
Conyza bonariensis*	Flax-leaved Fleabane	AH	Asteraceae
Conyza canadensis var. canadensis	Western Horseweed	AH	Asteraceae
Conyza coulteri - VR	Coulter Horseweed	AH	Asteraceae
Cordylanthus maritimus ssp. Maritimus - LE	Saltmarsh Bird's Beak	AH	Scrophulariaceae
Coreopsis gigantea	Giant Coreopsis	S	Asteraceae
Corethrogyne filaginifolia var. filaginifolia	California Cudweed-aster	PH	Asteraceae
Coronopus [Lepidium] didymus *	Wart Cress	AH	Brassicaceae
Cortaderia jubata*	Andean Pampas Grass	PG	Poaceae
Cortaderia selloana *	Uruguayan Pampas Grass	PG	Poaceae
Cortedaria dioica *	Pampas Grass	PG	Poaceae
Cotula coronopifolia*	Brass Buttons	PH	Asteraceae
Cotyledon orbiculata *	Stonecrop	S	Crassulaceae
Crassula connata	Pygmy Sand-weed	AH	Crassulaceae
Cressa truxillensis var. truxillensis - VU	Spreading Alkali-weed	PH	Convolvulaceae
Croton californicus var. californicus	California Croton	PH	Euphorbiaceae
Crypsis schoenoides *	Swamp Grass	PG	Poaceae
Cryptantha clevelandii	Cleveland Forget-Me-Not	AH	Boraginaceae
Cryptantha leiocarpa - VR	Coast Forget-Me-Not	AH	Boraginaceae
Cupressus macrocarpa +	Monterey Cypress	Т	Cupressaceae
Cuscuta californica var. californica	California Doddor	AV	Cuscutaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Cuscuta salina	Saltmarsh Dodder	AV	Cuscutaceae
Cuscuta salina var. major - VU	Saltmarsh Dodder	AV	Cuscutaceae
Cuscuta subinclusa	Canyon Dodder	AV	Cuscutaceae
Cynodon dactylon*	Bermuda Grass	PG	Poaceae
Cynosurus echinatus*	Hedgehog Dogtail	AG	Poaceae
Cyperus eragrostis	Umbrella-sedge	PG	Cyperaceae
Cyperus esculentus	Yellow Nut-sedge	PG	Cyperaceae
Cyperus involucratus	Umbrella-sedge	PG	Cyperaceae
Cyperus odoratus - VR	Fragrant Flatsedge	PG	Cyperaceae
Cytisus scoparius *	Scotch Broom	S	Fabaceae
Datura stramonium*	Jimson Weed	AH	Solanaceae
Datura wrightii	Western Jimson Weed	AH	Solanaceae
Deinandra fasciculata	Fascicled Tarplant	AH	Asteraceae
Delphinium parryi ssp. blochmaniae - CNPS 1B	Blochman Larkspur	PH	Ranunculaceae
Delphinium parryi ssp. maritimum - VR	Maritime Larkspur	PH	Ranunculaceae
Descurainia pinnata ssp. menziesii - VU	Menzies Tansy Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Descurainia sophia*	Tansy Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Digitaria sanguinalis*	Hairy Crabgrass	PG	Poaceae
Distichilis spicata var. spicata	Saltgrass	PG	Poaceae
Draba cuneifolia - VR	Wedgeleaf Draba	AH	Brassicaceae
Drosanthemum floribundum*	Dew Flower Iceplant	PH	Aizoaceae
Dudleya lanceolata	Lanceleaf Live-forever	PH	Crassulaceae
Dysphania ambrosioides *	Cutleaf Goosefoot	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Echinochloa crusgalli var. crus-galli *	Barnyard Grass	AG	Poaceae
Echinochloa crus-pavonis var. crus-pavonis *	Gulf Barnyard Grass	A/BG	Poaceae
Echinochloa frumentacea*	Barnyard Grass	A/BG	Poaceae
Echium candicans*	Pride-of-Madiera	S	Boraginaceae
Ehrharta erecta *	Erect Veldtgrass	PG	Poaceae
Eleocharis acicularis var. acicularis	Slender Spike-rush	PG	Cyperaceae
Eleocharis parishii	Parish's Spikerush	PG	Cyperaceae
Elymus glaucus	Blue Wildrye	PG	Poaceae
Emex spinosa*	Devil's Thorn	AH	Polygonaceae
Encelia californica	California Bush Sunflower	S	Asteraceae
Epilobium ciliatum ssp. ciliatum	Northern Willow-herb	AH	Onagraceae
Equisetum hyemale var. affine - VU	Giant Scouring Rush	PF	Equisetaceae
Equisetum laevigatum	Smooth Horsetail	PF	Equisetaceae
Eragrostis barrelieri *	Mediterranean Lovegrass	AG	Poaceae
Eragrostis mexicana	Mexican Lovegrass	AG	Poaceae
Ericameria ericoides ssp. ericoides - VU	Mock Heather	S	Asteraceae
Eriodictyon crassifolium	Thickleaf Yerba Santa	S	Boraginaceae
Eriogonum cinereum	Coastal Buckwheat	S	Polygonaceae
Eriogonum nudum var. auriculatum - VR	Ear-shaped Wild Buckwheat	PH	Polygonaceae
Eriogonum parvifolium var. parvifolium	Dune Buckwheat	S	Polygonaceae
Eriogonum parvifolium var. paynei - VU	Payne Dune Buckwheat	S	Polygonaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Erodium cicutarium*	Redstem Filaree	AH	Geraniaceae
Erodium moschatum *	Whitestem Filaree	AH	Geraniaceae
Erucastrum incanum*	Summer Mustard	BH	Brassicaceae
Erysimum insulare ssp. suffrutescens - VR	Island Wallflower	BH	Brassicaceae
Eucalyptus globulus var. globulus *+	Tasmanian Blue Gum	Т	Myrtaceae
Eucrypta chrysanthemifolia var. chrysanthemifolia	Common Eucrypta	AH	Boraginaceae
Euphorbia peplus *	Petty Spurge	AH	Euphorbiaceae
Euthamia occidentalis	Western Goldenrod	PH	Asteraceae
Festuca pratensis *	Meadow Fescue	PG	Poaceae
Festuca rubra - VR	Red Fescue	PG	Poaceae
Filago californica	California Cottonrose	AH	Asteraceae
Foeniculum vulgare *	Sweet Fennel	PH	Apiaceae
Frankenia salina	Alkali Heath	PH	Frankeniaceae
Galistoga parviflora *	Gallant Soldier	AH	Asteraceae
Galium angustifolium ssp. angustifolium	Chapparral Bedstraw	S	Rubiaceae
Galium aparine	Catchseed Bedstraw	AH	Rubiaceae
Gazania linearis*	Gazania	PH	Asteraceae
Gilia capitata ssp. abrotanifolia	Blue Field Gilia	AH	Polemoniaceae
Gnaphalium palustre	Lowland Cudweed	AH	Asteraceae
Grindelia hirsutula var. hirsutula - VU	Hirsute Gumplant	S	Asteraceae
Hedypnois cretica*	Crete Hedypnois	AH	Asteraceae
Helianthus annuus	Common Sunflower	AH	Asteraceae
Heliotropium curassavicum ssp./var. oculatum	Alkali Heliotrope	PH	Hydrophyllaceae
Herniaria hirsuta ssp. cinerea*	Hairy Herniawort	AH	Caryophyllaceae
Heterotheca grandiflora	Telegraph Weed	BH	Asteraceae
Heterotheca sessiliflora ssp. echioides	Hairy Golden-Aster	PH	Asteraceae
Hirschfeldia incana * [Erucastrum incanum]	Summar Mustard	A/BH	Brassicaceae
Hoffmannseggia glauca - VR	Indian Rushpea	S	Fabaceae
Hordeum brachyantherum ssp. brachyantherum - VU	Meadow Barley	AG	Poaceae
Hordeum brachyantherum ssp. californicum	California Barley	AG	Poaceae
Hordeum depressum - VR	Low Barley	AG	Poaceae
Hordeum murinum ssp. leporinum *	Hare Barley	AG	Poaceae
Hordeum vulgare var. vulgare*	Common Barley	AG	Poaceae
Hutchinsia [Hornungia] procumbens - VU	Desert Hutchinsia	AH	Brassicaceae
Hydrocotyle umbellata	Marsh Pennywort	PH	Apiaceae
Hydrocotyle verticilata - VR	Hydrocotyle	PH	Rananunculaceae
Hypochaeris glabra *	Smooth Cat's-ear	AH	Asteraceae
Isocoma menziesii var. menziesii	Menzies' Jimmyweed	S	Asteraceae
Isocoma menziesii var. vernonioides	Coastal Goldenbush	S	Asteraceae
Isocoma veneta var. vernonioides	Coastal Goldenbush	S	Asteraceae
Isolepis cernua var. cernua - VR	Low Clubrush	AG	Cyperaceae
Isomeris arborea	Bladderpod	S	Capperidaceae
Jaumea carnosa - VU	Fleshy Jaumea	PH	Asteraceae
Juncus acutus ssp. leopoldii - CNPS 4	Southwestern Spiny Rush	PG	Juncaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Juncus balticus ssp. balticus	Baltic Rush	PH	Juncaceae
Juncus balticus var. ater - VR	Rocky Mountain Rush	PG	Juncaceae
Juncus breweri	Brewer Rush	PG	Juncaceae
Juncus bufonius var. bufonius - VR	Common Toad Rush	AG	Juncaceae
Juncus bufonius var. congestus	Congested Toad Rush	AH	Juncaceae
Juncus mexicanus	Mexican Rush, Wiregrass	PH	Juncaceae
Juncus patens - VR	Common Rush	PG	Juncaceae
Juncus rugulosus - VU	Wrinkled Rush	PG	Juncaceae
Juncus textilis - VU	Basket Rush	PG	Juncaceae
Keckiella ternata var. septentrionalis	Bluestem Bush Penstemon	S	Veronicaceae
Kochia scoparia var. scoparia *	Common Kochia	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Lactuca serriola*	Prickly Lettuce	AH	Asteraceae
Laennecia [Conyza] coulteri - VU	Coulter Horseweed	AH	Asteraceae
Lamarckia aurea *	Goldentop	AG	Poaceae
Lasthenia ferrisiae - VR	Ferris Goldfields	AH	Asteraceae
Lasthenia glabrata ssp. coulteri - VR	Rayless Goldfields	AH	Asteraceae
Lavatera assurgentiflora ssp. assurgentiflora - VR	Malva Rose, Island Mallow	S	Malvaceae
Lemna valdiviana - VU	Big Duckweed	AH	Araceae
Lepidium lasiocarpum var. lasiocarpum - VU	Hairy-pod Peppergrass	AH	Brassicaceae
Lepidium pinnatifidum *	Pepperwort	AH	Brassicaceae
Lepidium strictum - VR	Prostrate Pepperwort	AH	Brassicaceae
Leptochloa fusca ssp. uninervia	Mexican Sprangletop	PG	Poaceae
Lessingia filaginifolia ssp. filaginifolia	California Cudweed-aster	PH	Asteraceae
Leymus condensatus	Giant Ryegrass	PG	Poaceae
Leymus triticoides	Creeping Ryegrass	PG	Poaceae
Limonium californicum - VR	California Sea Lavender	PH	Plumbaginaceae
Limonium otolepis *	Saltmarsh Sea Lavender	PH	Plumbaginaceae
Limosella aquatica	Mudwort	AH	Scrophulariaceae
Linaria canadensis var. canadensis - VR	Toadflax	A/BH	Veronicaceae
Lobularia maritima *	Sweet Alyssum	AH	Brassicaceae
Lolium multiflorum*	Italian Ryegrass	PG	Poaceae
Lolium perenne ssp. perenne*	Perennial Ryegrass	PG	Poaceae
Lotus salsuginosus var. salsuginosus ?	Coastal Lotus	AH	Fabaceae
Lotus scoparius var. scoparius	Deerweed	S	Fabaceae
Lupinus arboreus - VU	Dune Bush Lupine	S	Fabaceae
Lupinus chamissonis - VR	Dune Lupine	S	Fabaceae
Lupinus hirsutissimus	Stinging Lupine	AH	Fabaceae
Lupinus succulentus	Fleashy Lupine	AH	Fabaceae
Malacothrix clevelandii - VR	Cleveland Cliff-aster	AH	Asteraceae
Malacothrix incana	Dunedelion	PH	Asteraceae
Malacothrix similis - VR	Mexican Cliff-aster	AH	Asteraceae
Malosma laurina	Laurelleaf Sumac	S	Anacardiaceae
Malva parviflora *	Cheeseweed	AH	Malvaceae
Malvella leprosa - VU	Alkali-mallow	PH	Malvaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Marrubium vulgare*	White Horehound	PH	Lamiaceae
Medicago polymorpha *	Common Burclover	AH	Fabaceae
Medicago sativa*	Alfalfa	PH	Fabaceae
Melaleuca densa? *	Bottlebrush Melaleuca	S	Myrtaceae
Melilotus alba *	White Sweetclover	AH	Fabaceae
Melilotus indica *	Yellow Sweetclover	AH	Fabaceae
Melilotus officinalis *	Yellow Sweetclover	AH	Fabaceae
Mesembryanthemum crystallinum *	Crystalline Ice Plant	AH	Aizoaceae
Mesembryanthemum nodiflorum *	Slender-leaf Ice Plant	AH	Aizoaceae
Mimulus aurantiacus var. australis	Southern Bush Monkeyflower	S	Phrymaceae
Mimulus longiflorus ssp. longiflorus	Sticky Bush Monkeyflower	S	Phrymaceae
Monanthochloe littoralis - VR	Shoregrass	PG	Poaceae
Muhlenbergia microsperma	Littleseed Muhly	PG	Poaceae
Myoporum laetum *	Ngaio Tree	S/T	Myoporaceae
Myriophyllum brasiliense	Brasil Milfoil	AH	Haloragaceae
Narcissus 'King Alpert'*	King Alpert Daffodil	PH	Liliaceae
Nassella cernua	Foothill Needlegrass	PG	Poaceae
Nassella pulchra	Purple Needlegrass	PG	Poaceae
Nasturtium officinale [Rorippa nasturtium-aquaticum]	Water Cress	AH	Brassicaceae
Nicotiana glauca *	Tree Tobacco	S	Solanaceae
Oenothera elata ssp. hirsutissima	Hooker Primrose	AH	Onagraceae
Oenothera elata ssp. hookeri - VR	Showy Evening Primrose	AH	Onagraceae
Oligomeris linifolia - VU	Narrowleaf Oligomeris	AH	Resedaceae
Opuntia littoralis	Coastal Prickly Pear	S	Cactaceae
Opuntia oricola - VU	Tall Prickly Pear	S	Cactaceae
Opuntia parryi - VR	Valley Cholla	S	Cactaceae
Opuntia prolifera - VR	Coast Cholla	S	Cactaceae
Orobanche ramosa*	Branched Broomrape	PH	Orobanchaceae
Osteospermum ecklonis *+	Trailing African Daisy	PH	Asteraceae
Osteospermum fruticosum *+	Trailing African Daisy	PH	Asteraceae
Oxalis corniculata*	Creeping Wood Sorrel	PH	Oxalidaceae
Oxalis latifolia*	Broadleaf Woodsorrel	PH	Oxalidaceae
Oxalis pes-caprae *	Bermuda Buttercup	PH	Oxalidaceae
Oxalis wrightii*	Buttercup	PH	Oxalidaceae
Panicum capillare ssp. capillare*	Witchgrass	PG	Poaceae
Parapholis incurva *	Sickle Grass	AG	Poaceae
Pasapalum dilatatum*	Dallisgrass	PG	Poaceae
Pennisetum clandestinum *	Kikuyu Grass	PG	Poaceae
Pennisetum setaceum *	Tender Fountaingrass	PG	Poaceae
Pennisetum villosum*	Fountaingrass	PG	Poaceae
Petunia parviflora*	Petunia	AH	Solanaceae
Phacelia distans	Wild Heliotrope	PH	Boraginaceae
Phacelia parryi	Parry Phacelia	AH	Boraginaceae
Phacelia ramosissima var. austrolittoralis - CNPS 4	South Coast Branching Phacelia	PH	Boraginaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Phacelia ramosissima var. latifolia - VU	Branching Phacelia	PH	Boraginaceae
Phacelia ramosissima var. ramosissima	Branching Phacelia	PH	Boraginaceae
Phacelia tanacetifolia	Tansy Phacelia	AH	Boraginaceae
Phacelia viscida var. viscida	Sticky Phacelia	AH	Boraginaceae
Phalaris minor*	Lesser Canarygrass	AG	Poaceae
Physalis philadelphica*	Tomatillo	AH	Solanaceae
Picris echioides*	Bristly Ox-tounge	AH	Asteraceae
Pinus canariensis*	Canary Island Pine	Т	Araceae
Piptatherum miliaceum *	Smilo Grass	PG	Poaceae
Plantago erecta	California Plantain	AH	Plantaginaceae
Plantago lanceolata*	Narrowleaf Plantain	PH	Plantaginaceae
Plantago major *	Broadleaf or Common Plantain	PH	Plantaginaceae
Plantago pusilla*	Atlantic Plantain	AH	Plantaginaceae
Pluchea odorata - VU	Saltmarsh Fleabane	S	Asteraceae
Polygonum amphilium	Water Smartweed	PH	Polygonaceae
Polygonum arenastrum	Common Knotweed	AH	Polygonaceae
Polygonum aviculare ssp. aviculare*	Common Knotweed	AH	Polygonaceae
Polygonum aviculare ssp. depressum*	Common Knotweed	AH	Polygonaceae
Polygonum lapathifolium - VU	Willow Weed	AH	Polygonaceae
Polygonum punctatum var. punctatum - VU	Dotted Smartweed	AH	Polygonaceae
Polypogon australis*	Chilean Beardgrass	AG	Poaceae
Polypogon monspeliensis *	Rabbitsfoot Beardgrass	AG	Poaceae
Polypogon viridis *	Water Beardgrass	AG	Poaceae
Populus balsamifera ssp. trichocarpa	Black Cottonwood	Т	Salicaceae
Potamogeton foliosus	Leafy Pondweed	AH	Potamogetonaceae
Potentilla anserina ssp. pacifica - VR	Pacific Cinquifoil	PH	Rosaceae
Potentilla egedei var. grandis	Silver Beachweed	PH	Rosaceae
Pseudognaphalium biolettii	Bicolored Everlasting	BH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium californicum	Green Everlasting	BH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium leucocephylum - CNPS 2	Whiteleaf Everlasting	BH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium luteoalbum *	Everlasting Cudweed	AH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium microcephalum	White Everlasting	B/PH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium ramosissimum	Pink Everlasting	BH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium roseum*	Rosy Rabbit-tobacco	BH	Asteraceae
Pseudognaphalium stramineum *	Cotton-batting Cudweed	BH	Asteraceae
Raphanus sativus *	Wild Radish	AH	Brassicaceae
Reseda alba*	White Mignonette	S	Resedaceae
Rhus integrifolia	Lemonade Berry	S	Anacardiaceae
Ricinus communis *	Castor Bean	S	Euphorbiaceae
Rosa californica	California Wild Rose	S	Rosaceae
Rubus ursinus	Pacific Blackberry	PV	Rosaceae
Rumex crispus*	Curly Dock	PH	Polygonaceae
Rumex fueginus var. ovato-cordatus - VR	Oxnard Dock	PH	Polygonaceae
Rumex hymenosepalus - VR	Wild Rhubarb	PH	Polygonaceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Rumex kerneri*	Kerner's Dock	PH	Polygonaceae
Rumex martimus - VR	Golden Dock	PH	Polygonaceae
Ruppia maritima - VR	Wigeon-grass, Ditch-grass	PH	Zosteraceae
Salicornia bigelovii - VR	Bigelow Pickleweed	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Salicornia depressa - VR	Pickleweed	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Salix exigua	Narrowleaf Willow	S	Salicaceae
Salix hindsiana	Sandbar Willow	S	Salicaceae
Salix laevigata	Red Willow	Т	Salicaceae
Salix lasiolepis var. lasiolepis	Arroyo Willow	S	Salicaceae
Salsola australis *	Russian Thistle	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Salsola paulsenii*	Barbwire Thistle	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Salsola tragus *	Russian Thistle	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Salvia leucophylla	Purple Sage	S	Lamiaceae
Salvia mellifera	Black Sage	S	Lamiaceae
Sambucus mexicana	Blue Elderberry	S	Caprifoliaceae
Sarcocornia pacifica [Salicornia virginica] - VU	Virginia Glasswort	S	Chenopodiaceae
Schinus molle*	Peruvian Pepper	Т	Anacardiaceae
Schismus arabicus *	Arabian Grass	AG	Poaceae
Schismus barbatus*	Arabian Grass	AG	Poaceae
Schoenoplectus acutus var. occidentalis - VR	Viscid or Common Tule	PG	Cyperaceae
Schoenoplectus [Scirpus] americanus	American Bulrush	PG	Cyperaceae
Schoenoplectus californicus - VR	California Bulrush	PH	Cyperaceae
Scirpus maritimus	Saltmarsh Bulrush	PH	Cyperaceae
Scirpus pungens	Common Threesquare	PH	Cyperaceae
Scirpus robustus	Bulrush	PH	Cyperaceae
Scrophularia californica var. californica	California Figwort	PH	Scrophulariaceae
Senecio flaccidus var. douglasii	Douglas Butterweed	S	Asteraceae
Senecio vulgaris *	Common Groundsel	AH	Asteraceae
Sidalcea malviflora ssp. californica - VU	California Globemallow	PH	Malvaceae
Silene laniniata ssp. major	Mexican Pink	PH	Caryophyllaceae
Silybum marianum *	Milk Thistle	AH	Asteraceae
Sinapis arvensis*	Charlock	AH	Brassicaceae
Sisymbrium altissimum *	Tumble Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Sisymbrium irio *	London Rocket	AH	Brassicaceae
Sisymbrium orientale*	Eastern Mustard	AH	Brassicaceae
Solanum americanum*	White Nightshade	PH	Solanaceae
Solanum douglasii	Douglas Nightshade	PH	Solanaceae
Solanum elaeagnifolium *	Silverleaf Horse-nettle	PH	Solanaceae
Solanum nigrum *	Black Nightshade	AH	Solanaceae
Solanum physalifolium*	Nightshade	PH	Solanaceae
Solanum xanti var. xanti	Purple Nightshade	S	Solanaceae
Solidago californica	California Goldenrod	PH	Asteraceae
Sonchus asper ssp. asper *	Prickly Sowthistle	AH	Asteraceae
Sonchus oleraceus*	Common Sow-thistle	AH	Asteraceae



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family
Sorghum halepense	Johnson Grass	PG	Poaceae
Spartina foliosa	California Cordgrass	PG	Poaceae
Spergularia bocconei	Sand Spurry	AH	Caryophyllaceae
Spergularia macrotheca var. macrotheca	Large-flowered Sandspurry	PH	Caryophyllaceae
Spergularia marina - VR	Saltmarsh Sandspurry	AH	Caryophyllaceae
Stachys bullata	Pink Hedge Nettle	PH	Lamiaceae
Stellaria pallida	Pallid Chickweed	AH	Caryophyllaceae
Stenatophrum secundatum*	St. Augustine Grass	PG	Poaceae
Stephanomeria virgata ssp. pleurocarpa - VR	Wand Chicory	AH	Asteraceae
Stillingia spinulosa - VR	Broad-leaved Stillingia	PV	Euphorbiaceae
Suaeda calceoliformis - VR	Horned Seablite	AH	Chenopodiaceae
Suaeda californica var. pubescens - CNPS 1B	Hairy California Seablite	S	Chenopodiaceae
Suaeda esteroa - CNPS 1B	Estuary Seablite	PH	Chenopodiaceae
Suaeda nigra [S. moquinii] - VR	Bush Seepweed	S	Chenopodiaceae
Suaeda taxifolia - CNPS 4	California Seablite	S	Chenopodiaceae
Symphyotrichum [Aster] ascendens - VR	Long-leaved Aster	PH	Asteraceae
Tamarix ramosissima *	Saltcedar	S/T	Tamaricaceae
Tauschia arguta	Southern Tauschia	PH	Apiaceae
Tetragonia tetragonioides *	New Zealand Spinach	AH	Aizoaceae
Toxicodendron diversilobum	Western Poison Oak	PV	Anacardiaceae
Tribulus terrestris*	Puncture Vine	AH	Zygophyllaceae
Triglochin concinna - VR	Utah Arrow-grass	PH	Scheuchzeriaceae
Triglochin maritima - VR	Seaside Arrow-grass	PH	Scheuchzeriaceae
Triglochin striata - VR	Three-ribbed Arrow-grass	PG	Scheuchzeriaceae
Tropaeolum majus*	Garden Nasturtium	AH	Tropaolaceae
Typha domingensis	Narrow-leaved Cattail	PH	Typhaceae
Typha latifolia - VU	Broadleaf Cattail	PG	Typhaceae
Urtica dioica ssp. gracilis var. holosericea	Giant Creek Nettle	PH	Urticaceae
Urtica urens *	Dwarf Nettle	AH	Urticaceae
Verbena lasiostachys var. lasiostachys	Western Verbena	BH	Verbenaceae
Verbena tenuisecta*	Paraguay Verbena	AH	Verbenaceae
Verbesina encelioides ssp. encelioides *	Golden Crownbeard	PH	Asteraceae
Verbesina encelioides ssp. exauriculata *	Golden Crownbeard	PH	Asteraceae
Veronica americana	American Brookline	PH	Veronicaceae
Veronica anagallis-aquatica	Water Speedwell	AH	Veronicaceae
Vicia villosa*	Hairy Vetch	AV	Fabaceae
Washingtonia robusta *+	Mexican Fan Palm	Т	Arecaceae
Xanthium spinosum *	Spiny Cocklebur	AH	Asteraceae
Xanthium strumarium var. canadense	Cocklebur	AH	Asteraceae
Yucca baccata *	Spanish Bayonet	S/T	Agavaceae
Zantedeschia aethiopica *	Calla Lily	PG	Arecaceae
Zostera marina - VR	Eel-grass	PG	Zosteraceae

Notes: Scientific nomenclature follows Flora of North America Committee (1993-2007 - Flora of North America) or

Hickman (1993 - The Jepson Manual: Higher Plants of California).



Scientific Name & Rarity Status	Common Name	Habit	Family	
Common names follow Abrams and Ferris (1960), Neihaus and Ripper (1976), and DeGarmo (1980).				
Bold typeface indicates special-status species, LE = listed endangered; VR = locally rare; VU - locally uncommon.				
An "*" indicates non-native species that have become naturalized or persist without cultivation.				
An "+" indicates non-native species that where cultivated and/or persist without active cultivation after planting.				
Habit definitions:				
AF = annual fern or fern ally.	PG = perennial grass or graminoid.			
AG = annual grass or graminoid.	PH = perennial herb.			
AH = annual herb.	PV = perennial vine.			
BH = biennial herb.	S = shrub.			
PF = perennial fern or fern ally.	T = tree.			